In The Matter Of:

Jamie Marquardt v. Nicole Carlton, et al.

Jamie Marquardt December 12, 2018

Fincun-Mancini, Inc. 1801 E. Ninth Street Suite 1720 Cleveland, Ohio 44114 (216) 696-2272

Min-U-Script® with Word Index

EXHIBIT

Nic	cole Carlton, et al.			<u>December</u>	12, 2018
	Page 1				Page 3
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO	1		INDEX	
2	EASTERN DIVISION	2	WITNESS;	CROSS	
3		3	Jamie Marquardt		
4	Jamie Marquardt,	4	by Mr. Vance	6	
5	Plaintiff, (5			
6	vs.)Case No. 1:18-CV-00333-SO	6			
7	Nicole Carlton, et al., Solomon Oliver, Jr., J.	7		EXHIBITS	
8	Defendants.)	8	Defendants':	Marked	
9		9	1	23	
10		10	2	24	
11	Deposition of Jamie Marquardt, the plaintiff	11	3	27	
12	herein, called on behalf of the defendants for oral	12	4	29	
13	examination, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil	13	5	52	
14	Procedure, taken before Karen A. Toth, Notary Public	14	6	55	
15	in and for the State of Ohio, pursuant to notice, at	15	7	83	
16	the offices of Zashin & Rich, Ernst & Young Tower,	16	8	127	
17	950 Main Avenue, 4th Floor, Cleveland, Ohio 44113 on	17	9 and 10	133	
18	Wednesday, December 12, 2018, commencing at	18	11	135	
19	9:58 a.m.	19	12	137	
20		20	13	138	
21		21	14	140	
22		22	15	141	
23		23	16	143	
24		24	17	146	
25		25	18	154	
	Page 2				Page 4
1	APPEARANCES:	1	EX	HIBITS (Cont.)	
2	On behalf of the Plaintiff:	2	Defendants':	Marked	
3	William C. Livingston, Esq.	3	19	157	
4	Berkman, Gordon, Murray & DeVan 55 Public Square, Suite 2200	4	20	160	
5	Cleveland, Ohio 44113	5	21	162	
6	On behalf of the Defendants:	6	22	169	
7	David R. Vance, Esq.	7	23	176	
8	Patrick J. Hoban, Esq. Zashin & Rich	8	24	181	
9	Ernst & Young Tower	9	25	184	
10	950 Main Street, 4th Floor Cleveland, Ohio 44113	10	26	186	
11	Also present:	11	27	199	
12	Nicole Coleman	12	28	200	
13	Jzinae Jackson (After lunch)	13	29	202	
14		14	30	203	
15		15	31	203	
16		16	32	232	
17		17	33	232	
18	į	18	34	234	
19	,	19	35	238	
20	,	20	36		
21	,	21	36 37	259	
22	,	22	38	260	
23	İ	23	38	263	i
24		24		266	
25		25	40 41	268	
		رے		269	

141001	Daniel Control	1		December 12, 2010
	Page 33			Page 35
1	was for angioedema.	1	Α	Separation from the City?
2 Q	And what is that, sir?	1	Q	From the City.
3 A	It's a reaction to a blood pressure medicine.	1	Ă	No.
4	Throat, face, tongue swell.		Q	And how long before your separation from the
5 Q	Kind of like anaphylaxis?	5	V	City were you divorced; do you recall?
6 A	Much worse.		٨	Maybe less than a year.
1			A	
7 Q	And when was that; do you recall?	1	Q	Okay. So you just stated that you spoke with
8 A	I believe I provided that to you. I don't	8		your ex-wife about what happened. What is
9	remember the exact date. There were a	9		what happened?
10	number unfortunately it happened a number	10		With the Facebook posts.
11	of times.	11	-	And what did you two discuss?
12 Q	What is your current address?	12		I just told her I didn't do it.
13 A	10034 Pleasant Lake Boulevard, Apartment J18,	13	Q	Is that a verbal communication?
14	Parma.	14	Α	Yes.
15 Q	How long have you been in that apartment?	15	Q	Any other conversations you've had with your
16 A	At least three years.	16		ex-wife about this case?
17 Q	Do you live with anyone?	17	Α	Yes.
18 A	No.	18	Q	Okay. What is that?
19 Q	And you're divorced; is that correct?	19		My kids. My two daughters.
20 A	Correct.	20		For the record, I don't want to know what your
21 Q	And when were you divorced?	21	•	daughters' names are. I'm going to ask you
22 A	2015. 2015.	22		how old they are here, but other than that
23 Q	Is that when it was finalized?	23		we'll try to keep their names out of the
24 A	I believe so, yeah, somewhere in that area.	24		record, okay?
25 Q	And what is your ex-wife's name?	25	٨	Sure.
25 Q	And what is your ex-write's hame:	25	А	Suic.
	Page 34			Page 36
1	·		_	
1 A	Debra.	1	Q	Sorry. I didn't mean to cut you off. I
2 Q	Does she is still go by Marquardt?	2		wanted to make that clear.
3 A	Yes.	3	A	That's okay. My two daughters are being
4 Q	Have you discussed with your ex-wife this case	4		harassed at school regarding that because it
5	at all?	5		was in the news.
6 A	Only when she yes, I did.	6	Q	So the two of you spoke about that?
7 Q	What have you discussed?	7	Α	Yes.
8 A	I think I when it originally happened I	8	Q	Anything else?
9	told her what happened.		À	Not that I can recall, no.
10 Q	What do you mean by what happened?	10	O	Are you currently dating?
11	MR. LIVINGSTON: Can we clarify the	11	-	No.
12	time frame, whether you were married or	12		And how old are your daughters?
13	divorced?	13	-	My daughters are 14 and 16.
14	MR. VANCE: I'll worry about the	14		Have you discussed the case with them at all?
15	record and whether or not it's clear, okay?	15	-	Yes.
16	MR. LIVINGSTON: That could be a	16		Okay. What have you told to them?
	privilege. That's why I'm stating that.	17	-	That, you know, you're going to see some stuff
17	MR, VANCE: I asked him when he		Л	on the news.
18		18	0	
19	spoke with his ex-wife about it.	19	-	Anything else?
20	MR. LIVINGSTON: I know and I'm saying	20		No.
21	ex-wife at the time? This is a privilege that	21	-	Where did you go to high school?
22	I have to protect. I just want to clarify and	22		Midview.
23	make sure he wasn't married at the time.		Q	And you graduated of Midview?
24 Q	Were you married at the time of your	24		Yes.
25	separation, sir?	25	Q	Do you have any post high school education?
1		ı		

1	<u>Cariton, et al.</u>	,		December 12, 2016
	Page 49			Page 51
1	just understood you don't do that,	1	Q	In the first paragraph there, second line, it
2 Q	Did somebody tell you that you were prohibited	2	٧.	talks about the shooting of a 12 year old boy
3	from doing those things?	3		who police said was killed by an officer when
4 A	No. It's just an understanding that every	4		the boy reached toward his waistband for a
5	I mean, you know, you don't post stuff like	5		realistic pellet gun in November 2014.
6	that.	1	Α	Yes.
7 Q	How did you come to have that understanding?	7		Is that fairly accurate or is that an accurate
8 A	Well, my ex works for Cleveland Clinic. They	8	*	description of the Tamir Rice incident?
9	have a very strict social media policy. So,	1	Α	The date appears correct.
10	you know, I kind of knew the ins and outs of	10		You believe it was in November of 2014?
11	what you can and can't post, plus just	11		If they put it, yes. I have no reason not to.
12	watching the news.	1	Q	And is it your understanding that the claim
13 Q	Did anyone ever from the City direct you as to	13	•	was that Tamir reached into his waistband for
14	what you could or could not post on your	14		a gun?
15	Facebook?	15	A	Am I aware of the claim?
16 A	There is a social media policy within the	1	Q	Your understanding of the incident?
17	City.	17		Yes.
18 Q	And had you received that social media policy?	1	Q	And is it your understanding that that gun
19 A	I never received it.	19	~	turned out to be fake?
20 Q	You were a captain at the time of your	20	Α	Yes.
21	separation from the City?	1	Q	And was there an orange safety tip that was
22 A	Correct.	22	Y	removed from that gun; is that your
23 Q	As part of your duties as captain were you	23		understanding?
24	responsible for ensuring that your	24	Δ	I have no idea. I had heard that.
25	subordinates abided by general orders of EMS?	25		That was something that you had heard?
25	subordinates ablact by general orders of Elvis:	25	Q	That was something that you had heard:
	Page 50			Page 52
1 A	Yes.	1	Α	Yes.
2 Q	And you had access to those general orders?	1	Q	And is it your understanding that Tamir was
зÀ		1	_	-
1	I have access to what I was given.	3		indeed a 12 year old boy?
4 0	I have access to what I was given. Did you know where you could find general	1	A	indeed a 12 year old boy? That's my understanding, yes.
4 Q	Did you know where you could find general	4		That's my understanding, yes.
5	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain?	4 5	Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police?
5 6 A	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online.	4 5 6	Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding.
5 6 A 7 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online?	4 5 6 7	Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in	4 5 6	Q A Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right?
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders.	4 5 6 7 8 9	Q A Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died.
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there	4 5 6 7 8 9	Q A Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding	4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q A Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy?
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q A Q A Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q A Q A Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy?
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q A Q A Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes.
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q A Q A Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes.
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q A Q A Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5.
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q A Q A Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q A Q A Q A Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.)
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q A Q A Q A Q Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir?
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct? Yes.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q A Q A Q A Q Q	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir? This is the post that ultimately I received my
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct? Yes. Do you recall when that was?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q A Q A Q A Q Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir? This is the post that ultimately I received my termination for.
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 Q 22 A	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct? Yes. Do you recall when that was? No.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q A Q A Q A Q Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir? This is the post that ultimately I received my termination for. There is a couple posts here; is there not?
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 Q 22 A 23 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct? Yes. Do you recall when that was? No. So let's go back, if we could, go back to	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir? This is the post that ultimately I received my termination for. There is a couple posts here; is there not? Two separate posts?
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 Q 22 A 23 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct? Yes. Do you recall when that was? No. So let's go back, if we could, go back to Exhibit 4.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir? This is the post that ultimately I received my termination for. There is a couple posts here; is there not? Two separate posts? Yes, this looks like it's the start of the one
5 6 A 7 Q 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 Q 22 A 23 Q	Did you know where you could find general orders when you were a captain? They were starting to be put online. And how do you mean online? Through your city account they would be in folders. Any other way in which you believe that there are — how you came to have this understanding of what was and was not allowed to be posted on Facebook? No. Can you describe for me what happened relative to Tamir Rice? I don't understand the question. So obviously there was a shooting that involved Tamir Rice, correct? Yes. Do you recall when that was? No. So let's go back, if we could, go back to	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q Q A	That's my understanding, yes. And that he was shot by the police? Yes, that's my understanding. And that he died the following day; is that right? I don't recall when he died. I know he died. Would you consider that incident to have been a tragedy? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. A tragedy? Yes. Yes. Let's go to Exhibit 5. (Defendant's Exhibit 5 marked for identification.) What is Exhibit 5, sir? This is the post that ultimately I received my termination for. There is a couple posts here; is there not? Two separate posts?

MIC	ole	Cariton, et al.			December 12, 2018
		Page 53			Page 55
1	Q	So there is a post at the top of Page 1 and	1		correct?
2	~	then there is a second post that begins on	2	Α	Yes.
3		Page 1 but it's not the whole thing, and then	3	Q	And that interview was the same week as the
4		the whole thing is on Page 2; is that right?	4	~	post, correct?
1	Α	Yes. It's a this is a post and it looks	5	Α	I believe so, yes.
6	11	like this one is a reply. (Indicating.)	6	Q	Okay. And you were to be truthful during the
1	Q	A reply to a comment to the original post?	7	Y	interview; is that right?
1	Ă	It must be, yeah.	8	Α	Yes.
1	Q	Okay. So if you could for me please read into	9	Q	And were you truthful during that interview?
10	V	the record what the first post is.	1 -	Ă	Yes.
11	Α	What it is?	11		MR. VANCE: Okay. Bill, I don't
12		Yeah, please read it for me.	12		have this to give to you today but this is the
13		"Let me be the first on record to have the	13		recording of that interview. You have it
14	21	balls to say Tamir Rice should have been shot	14		already. It was produced at — I can't tell
15		and I am glad he is dead. I wish I was in the	15		you the exact number. But after this depo is
16		park that day as he terrorized innocent	16		over I'll email it to you. And, Karen, I'll
17		patrons by pointing a gun at them walking	17		email it to as well so you can include it in
18		around acting bad. I am upset I did not get	18		the exhibits.
19		the chance to kill the little criminal	19		MR. LIVINGSTON: So are you marking
20		fucker."	20		this as 6?
21	0	And then if you could read the reply.	21		MR. VANCE: I will mark this as
22	V	MR. LIVINGSTON: I'll object. The	22		6.
23		document speaks for itself, but you can go	23		(Defendants' Exhibit 6
24		ahead.	24		marked for identification.)
25	Δ	"Stop Kevin. How would you feel if you"	25		MR. VANCE: And so we're all on
25	Д	Stop Kevini, 110w would you feel if you	25		MR. VAIVEE. And so were an on
		Page 54			Page 56
1		it's cut off "Walking in the park and some	1		the same page, this is Bates stamped City
2		ghetto rat pointed a gun in your face? Would	2		0560.
3		you" cut off again 'to him as a hero?	3		If anybody has any trouble listening
4		Cleveland sees this felony hood rat as a	4		or hearing, it should be loud enough but just
5		hero."	5		say so. I'm just going to play a little bit
6	Q	On the second page there it says two hours	6		of it from the beginning.
7	•	ago. Do you see that on the bottom?	7		(Tape playing.)
8	Α	Yes.	8		(Tape stopped.)
	Q	And then there is what exact time do you	9	Q	Let me pause this for a second. So Sunday
10	_	believe that these posts were made on your	10	_	night is when you believe that this started;
11		Facebook these posts showed up on your	11		is that correct?
12		Facebook page, correct?	12		MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I believe
13	Α	Yes.	13		he said probably Sunday.
	Q	And when exactly do you believe these posts	14		MR. VANCE: Then he said it was
15	`	were on your Facebook page?	15		Sunday night.
16	Α	Sometime in the morning.	16	Α	Whatever the tape says.
	Q	The morning of what date, do you recall?	17		Let's go back and listen to it again. We can
18	-	It would have been the 14th. I believe the	18	`	do that.
19		14th. Like I said, I don't know the dates.	19		(Tape playing.)
ııy	_	Okay.	20		(Tape stopped.)
l	0			\cap	Okay. So is it your recollection that on
20	-		21		
20 21	-	I would have to look at something. I think	21 22	V	
20 21 22	À	I would have to look at something. I think it's the 14th.	22	V.	Sunday night somebody had come over to your
20 21 22 23	À	I would have to look at something. I think it's the 14th. So let's try and get this date squared away so	22 23		Sunday night somebody had come over to your house?
20 21 22	À	I would have to look at something. I think it's the 14th.	22	A	Sunday night somebody had come over to your

i	Gariton, et al.	1	December 12, 2010
	Page 65		Page 67
1 A	On Page 1 I would agree that he was walking	1	child shot. You have, you know, the police
2	around acting bad.	2	having to shoot him. You have public outrage.
3 Q	Okay. Anything else you don't disagree with	3	You have public support. You have I mean,
4	or you don't agree with? Excuse me. Excuse	4	it was just a whole it's a national story.
5	me. Let me scratch that. Anything else that	5	Endless.
6	you disagree with as to these posts?	6 Q	What part of the sentence "I am upset I did
7 A	Disagree with?	7	not get the chance to kill the little criminal
8 Q	Yes.	8	fucker" relates to a social concern, if any?
9 A	Or agree with?	9 A	I don't know if it's a social concern. It's
10 Q	Agree with. Excuse me. Anything else you	10	someone's opinion.
11	agree with as to these posts?	11 Q	And same question relative to any political
12 A	I believe he where it says terrorized	12	concern; do these posts relate in any way to a
13	innocent patrons, I believe he did that. Or	13	political concern?
14	the tape, the videotape that was on the news	14 A	I believe the case is a political concern,
15	appeared to show that.	15	yes.
16 Q	Anything else?	16 Q	What aspect of "I'm upset I did not get a
17 A	No, not on Page 1.	17	chance to kill the little criminal fucker"
18 Q	How about Page 2?	18	relates to a political concern, if any?
19 A	I mean, if I take out the some ghetto rat I	19 A	I don't think it has anything to do with it.
20	would see, I didn't I don't know what	20 Q	And why do you believe that the posts here
21	the person was replying to. But the fact	21	relate in any way to a community concern?
22	that, you know, it's not cool to have a gun	22 A	I read it as one person's opinion.
23	pointed at your head. That's what.	23 Q	Okay.
24 Q	Do these posts in any way speak out against	24 A	That's the way I'm reading it.
25	the City of Cleveland?	25 Q	Were these posts upsetting to you?
	320 329 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37 37	\	
	Page 66	í	
1	rage oo		Page 68
1 A	•	1 A	
1 A	The City?	1 A 2 O	I was upset about them, yes.
2 Q	The City? Yes, sir.	2 Q	I was upset about them, yes. How come?
2 Q 3 A	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I	2 Q 3 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook
2 Q 3 A 4	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that.	2 Q 3 A 4	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they	2 Q 3 A 4 5	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion.
2 Q 3 A 4	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do	2 Q 3 A 4	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad?
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid.
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious,
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes.
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous?
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q 20	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they relate in any way to a social concern?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in the park that day when the crime was
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q 20 21 A	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they relate in any way to a social concern? This whole case was a social concern.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18 19 20 21	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in the park that day when the crime was occurring, it's almost like a support for the
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q 20 21 A 22 Q	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they relate in any way to a social concern. How so do you believe that those posts relate	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18 19 20 21 22	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in the park that day when the crime was occurring, it's almost like a support for the police officer is the way I read this. Now,
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q 20 21 A 22 Q 23	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they relate in any way to a social concern? This whole case was a social concern. How so do you believe that those posts relate to a social concern of the City or of the	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in the park that day when the crime was occurring, it's almost like a support for the police officer is the way I read this. Now, if somebody else reads it they can get a
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q 20 21 A 22 Q 23 24	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they relate in any way to a social concern? This whole case was a social concern. How so do you believe that those posts relate to a social concern of the City or of the community?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in the park that day when the crime was occurring, it's almost like a support for the police officer is the way I read this. Now, if somebody else reads it they can get a different opinion of it. Obviously it's black
2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 15 16 17 A 18 19 Q 20 21 A 22 Q 23	The City? Yes, sir. No. Well, I mean it says Cleveland but I don't know what they mean by that. But as you read them you don't feel that they speak out against the City in any way, do they? I don't know the intention of the writer. They don't appear to be. If anything they seem to attack Tamir Rice; is that correct? Yes, that's what it appears to be. Do these posts in any way relate to a public concern, that you're aware of? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. You can answer. I'm not sure. Is there a way you can reword that? Sure. These posts, as you read them, do they relate in any way to a social concern? This whole case was a social concern. How so do you believe that those posts relate to a social concern of the City or of the	2 Q 3 A 4 5 6 Q 7 8 A 9 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 16 A 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I was upset about them, yes. How come? Because, number one, it was on my Facebook post and it made it look like it was my opinion. And if you had this opinion why would that be bad? Because the person wants to shoot it appears they want to shoot a kid. And you would consider that to be egregious, the death of a child and the idea that I would consider that somebody wants to kill a child is If that was the person's true intention, yes. Yes, that's pretty heinous? It's I don't know how to answer that question because, you know, I've read this post a thousand times and to me it I took this as it appears that if this person was in the park that day when the crime was occurring, it's almost like a support for the police officer is the way I read this. Now, if somebody else reads it they can get a

1110010	Caritori, et al.		December 12, 2010
	Page 69		Page 71
1	it's up to the reader to determine. And the	1 Q	You oversee all EMS employees?
2	only person that truly knows is the person	2 À	On my shift and when I work overtime hours,
3	that posted it and I'm not him so I don't	3	yes.
4	know.	4 Q	Do you believe that these posts harmed your
_	How exactly do you read the police into either	5	friendships?
_	of those posts, Mr. Marquardt?	6 A	No.
6		1	
7 A	Because it appears I don't know about read	7 Q	Why not?
8	the police into it. It appears that there was	8 A	Because I would have known. Somebody would
9	a crime being committed and that, you know,	9	have said I don't want to be friends with you
10	obviously the police shot him and this	10	anymore.
11	person's saying he would shoot him.	11 Q	Do you feel these posts at all negatively
12 Q	And that he was angry that he didn't get the	12	impacted your working relationships?
13	chance to do that?	13 A	No.
14 A	Well that one, yeah. I don't see the police	14 Q	Had you been the one, at least according to
15	in that part.	15	you that and I understand that you say you
16 Q	I'm still confused on where exactly do you	16	didn't make these posts, but had you made
17	read the police into these posts?	17	these posts would they have impacted your
18 A	I don't read the police into it, but at this	18	working relationships?
19	particular time, if I recall correctly,	19 A	You're asking me to predict something. I
20	everybody was attacking the police and it	20	don't know.
21	seemed like everybody was polarized in one	21 Q	Were you worried about the adverse effects of
22	direction or the other. They were either	22	the posts?
23	supporting the police and had this type of	23 A	Absolutely.
24	opinion or they were supporting, you know,	24 Q	Why?
25	Tamir Rice and his you know, his actions.	25 A	Because it was on the news. I was more
23	Talini 1000 and mo — you know, ms accions.	23 11	Doodage it was on the news. I was more
	Page 70		Page 72
1.0		4	
1 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum?	1	worried about my kids.
2 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it.	2 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about?
2 A 3 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice	2 Q 3 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think
2 A 3 Q 4	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead?	2 Q 3 A 4	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was?
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not?
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not?
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct?
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A 18	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever?
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A 18 19	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A 18 19 20	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about it. I was worried about that.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No. Why not?
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A 18 19 20 21 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I — yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about it. I was worried about that. And you can speak to the totality of EMS?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No. Why not? Because everybody had an opinion at the time,
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A 18 19 20 21 Q 22 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about it. I was worried about that. And you can speak to the totality of EMS? I would have heard about it, yes.	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No. Why not? Because everybody had an opinion at the time, like I said. There were opinions all over the
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 12 A 13 Q 14 A 15 16 Q 17 A 18 19 20 21 Q 22 A 23 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about it. I was worried about that. And you can speak to the totality of EMS? I would have heard about it, yes. Why would you have heard about it?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A 22 23	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No. Why not? Because everybody had an opinion at the time, like I said. There were opinions all over the place.
2 A 3 Q 4 5 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 17 A 18 19 20 Q 21 Q 22 A 23 Q 24 A	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about it. I was worried about that. And you can speak to the totality of EMS? I would have heard about it, yes. Why would you have heard about it? Because I'm a captain of operations. I	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A 22 23 24 Q	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No. Why not? Because everybody had an opinion at the time, like I said. There were opinions all over the place. If these posts had been attributed to you as a
2 A 3 Q 4 A 6 Q 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 Q 11 A 13 Q 14 A 15 Q 17 A 18 19 20 Q 21 Q 22 A 23 Q	Where did you fall in that spectrum? I saw both sides of it. Were you glad this 12 year old boy Tamir Rice was dead? No. Did you in any way see that as a good thing? No. So is it fair to call these posts egregious? Yes. I yes. I mean, that part of it, yes. Do you agree that these posts have a potential to affect EMS operations? No. Why not? Because they didn't. It's my opinion it didn't affect it at all. Why do you believe that to be the case? Because I got blamed for this and I continued to work after this post was made for a month and there were absolutely no ill effects about it. I was worried about that. And you can speak to the totality of EMS? I would have heard about it, yes. Why would you have heard about it?	2 Q 3 A 4 5 Q 6 7 A 8 Q 9 A 10 11 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A 22 23	worried about my kids. Anything else you were worried about? I was worried that people were going to think that this was who I was. Any concern that you as a captain of EMS, that they'd also consider this is who EMS was? No. Why not? Because people that know me know I wouldn't this is not me, so I wasn't concerned about that. You don't know everybody in the City, correct? I thought you were talking about EMS. No, just that there would be a concern that this would be attributed to you and in turn attributed to EMS. No, I don't believe so. No concern about that whatsoever? No. Why not? Because everybody had an opinion at the time, like I said. There were opinions all over the place.

MICOIL	Carlton, et al.			December 12, 2018
	Page 73			Page 75
1	become angry with EMS?	1		talked about Tamir Rice.
2 A	I don't again, you're asking me to predict	1	Α	I would never say that. That's not true.
3	something. I don't know. I can't speak for	3	11	First of all, everybody in the City discussed
!	•	4		Tamir Rice, and I would never say that I never
4 .	the public.			used the F word. I was referring to Facebook.
5 Q	Let's say if the public was angry with EMS,	5		
6	would that be a problem for EMS? Could that	6		My Facebook posts. That's what we were
7	create a problem?	7	0	talking about. So that testimony relative to your OIC
8 A	It could create a problem, yes.	8	Q	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
9 Q	What do you think the public's reaction would	9		interview with Mr. Votypka, that was strictly
10	be if it felt that an EMS captain wanted to	10	A	limited to Facebook?
11	kill a child?	11		Actually, my Facebook word posts, yes.
12	MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.	12	Ų	How about the N word, have you ever use the N
13 A	I don't know.	13		word?
14 Q	Now, we spoke a little bit about your	14		MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can
15	interview with Mr. Votypka. Were you 100	15		answer.
16	percent truthful as part of that interview?	16		Throughout my whole life?
17 A	As I recall, yes.	17		Throughout the last five years let's say.
18 Q	Do you recall stating during that interview	18	A	I don't recall. It's possible. I'm not going
19	that I never used the F word?	19	_	to deny it.
20 A	I never said that. I said I never used the F	20	Q	Did you use the N word in a derogatory fashion
21	word on Facebook.	21		in the last five years?
22 Q	Let's go back to Exhibit 6, if we could.	22		MR. LIVINGSTON: Same objection.
23	Just so the record is clear, Exhibit 6	23		Same answer. Possible.
24	is a recording of your interview with	24	Q	You understand that the N word is a highly
25	Mr. Votypka, correct?	25		inflammatory word?
	Page 74			Page 76
1 A		1	A	
1 A	Yes.	1	A O	Yes.
2 Q	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can	2	Q	Yes. It's a racist word?
2 Q 3	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen.	2	Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory.
2 Q 3 4	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.)	2 3 4	Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word?
2 Q 3 4 5	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.)	2 3 4 5	Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I	2 3 4 5 6	Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was	2 3 4 5 6 7	Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook.	2 3 4 5 6	Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck —	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q A Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not —	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not — It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q A Q A Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not — It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q A Q A Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice? Not in my posts, no.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate with your friends?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A 19 Q	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not — It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q A Q A Q A Q A A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A 19 Q 20	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not — It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice? Not in my posts, no. Not in your posts. Anywhere on Facebook at all?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate with your friends? Just joking around. How so?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice? Not in my posts, no. Not in your posts. Anywhere on Facebook at all? That's possible. I have conversations all the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate with your friends? Just joking around.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A 22	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not — It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice? Not in my posts, no. Not in your posts. Anywhere on Facebook at all? That's possible. I have conversations all the time with persons.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate with your friends? Just joking around. How so? Simple as that, just joking around.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice? Not in my posts, no. Not in your posts. Anywhere on Facebook at all? That's possible. I have conversations all the time with persons. Seemed pretty clear to me that this was not	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate with your friends? Just joking around. How so? Simple as that, just joking around. MR. LIVINGSTON: I'm going to object
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 8 9 Q 10 11 A 12 Q 13 14 A 15 Q 16 17 18 A 19 Q 20 A 22 A 22 A	Yes. All right. Let me play it here. If you can listen. (Tape playing.) (Tape stopped.) I was referring to Facebook when I said I don't use the word fuck or balls. It was Facebook. So through Facebook and as part of Facebook you never use fuck — Not in my posts, no. Any other part of Facebook that you use that word? Maybe during personal conversations, not — It talked about also Tamir Rice. Have you ever through Facebook posted anything about Tamir Rice? Not in my posts, no. Not in your posts. Anywhere on Facebook at all? That's possible. I have conversations all the time with persons.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A	Yes. It's a racist word? It is highly inflammatory. You don't consider it a racist word? Not always. You as a white man, if you were to use that word would you consider it to be racist? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. You can answer. It depends how it's used. If you're using it to refer to a black individual, would that be racist? Not necessarily. No? Why not? Cuz I could I use it once in a while. I'm sure I used it with my friends. In what context would this word be appropriate with your friends? Just joking around. How so? Simple as that, just joking around. MR. LIVINGSTON: I'm going to object to this whole line of questioning.

	JOIC	· Carlton, et al.			December 12, 2018
		Page 89			Page 91
1	A	This was printed before I deleted anything.	1		and then there were a number of messages on
1	Q	Had to have been, otherwise we wouldn't have	2		Facebook.
3	-	it.	1	Q	Messages on your phone, I'm assuming those are
	Α	No, but I mean the reply. There is something	4	V	text messages you're referring to?
5		missing is what I'm saying. Because Kevin's	1	Α	Text messages, voice messages.
		replying to something.	1	Q	Let's start with voice messages. Do you
6		Well, you're replying to Kevin.	7	V	recall who left a voice mail for you?
	Q	Right, but first of all, it's not me, but		Α	I believe my sister.
8		•	8		Which sister?
9	•	Your account is replying to Kevin?	•	Q	
	A	Right. But whatever Kevin had written is not	10		Her name is Shelley.
11	0	in here.	11	-	What's her last name?
	Q	Right. And that would most likely be if	12		Nowak.
13		you go to the first page there is one comment	13	Ų	And any other voice mail messages that you're
14		to the original post?	14		aware of?
	A	Yes.	15	A	Not that I can recall. As I said, I don't
1	Q	Do you recall whether or not you ever read	16	_	remember.
17		that comment?	17	Ų	And I'm assuming you don't have that voice
1	A	I don't recall.	18		mail message any longer?
	Q	So you don't know if that comment was made by	19		No.
20		Kevin or not?	20		Who all do you recall receiving texts from?
	Α	I just I can't figure this out because it	21	Α	I can't differentiate between texts and
22		says one comment but then it's got this	22	_	Facebook messages.
23		comment under there. So that — there would	23		Okay.
24	_	have to be two comments.	24	A	So I don't know which one they did. You know,
25	Q	Not necessarily if you reply to a comment.	25		I can't remember that far back.
		Page 90			Page 92
1	Α	There is a comment. This one and Kevin's.	١,	Q	Who do you recall either sending you a
1	Q	But you don't have all this had been	2	~	Facebook message or a text message about the
3	~	deleted. You deleted all this from your	3		posts?
4		Facebook account, correct?	1	Α	The ones I remember were John Wearstler. I'm
	A	1 deebook deebuni, correct:		7.7	
		When I gaw it wes			
I .		When I saw it, yes. But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar?	5		trying to think who else did. I think John
6	Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar?	5 6	Ω	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure.
6 7	Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes.	5 6 7	Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara?
6 7 8	Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin?	5 6 7 8	Ā	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with.
6 7 8 9	Q A Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes.	5 6 7 8 9	A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS?
6 7 8 9	Q A Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any	5 6 7 8 9	A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me.
6 7 8 9 10	Q A Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post,	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore
6 7 8 9 10 11	Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A Q A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A Q A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A Q A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q A Q A Q A Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q A Q A Q A Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke up?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A Q A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5? How do you want me to —
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke up? I think it was somewhere around noon. I know	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5? How do you want me to — If you had to assign a percentage to it, if
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke up? I think it was somewhere around noon. I know it was after noon.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A Q A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5? How do you want me to — If you had to assign a percentage to it, if you're on a scale of zero to 100 percent,
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke up? I think it was somewhere around noon. I know it was after noon. And how exactly was it that you found out	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A Q A Q A Q A Q A	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5? How do you want me to — If you had to assign a percentage to it, if you're on a scale of zero to 100 percent, what's your comfort level that Donnie was the
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke up? I think it was somewhere around noon. I know it was after noon. And how exactly was it that you found out about the Facebook posts?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	A Q A Q A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5? How do you want me to — If you had to assign a percentage to it, if you're on a scale of zero to 100 percent, what's your comfort level that Donnie was the one that did this?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q A Q A Q A Q A Q A Q	But that Kevin you believe to be Kevin Poplar? I believe so, yes. And that's your cousin? Yes. And you don't have any recollection of any comments that were made to your original post, what that one comment may have been? No. Do you recall when you went to bed on February 15th, when in that morning? Yeah, I said it was probably four or five. Four or five in the morning, a.m.? Yeah. And do you recall when it was that you woke up? I think it was somewhere around noon. I know it was after noon. And how exactly was it that you found out	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A Q A Q A Q A Q	trying to think who else did. I think John McNamara but I'm not sure. Who is John McNamara? Somebody I used to work with. In EMS? Yes. I don't recall who else called me. You don't have any of these messages anymore I'm assuming? No. You deleted them? Yeah. I have to because voice mail only holds so much and the messages on Facebook only goes so long I think. How certain are you that Donnie made these posts on Exhibit 5? How do you want me to — If you had to assign a percentage to it, if you're on a scale of zero to 100 percent, what's your comfort level that Donnie was the

	e Cariton, et al.	·	
	Page 109		Page 111
1 A	Probably have.	1 A	No.
2 Q		2 Q	How about Ed Eckart? He's the assistant
_	anybody were any other posts and the early	3	safety director for the City?
3		4 A	Correct.
4	morning of February 15th other than what's in	1	
5	Exhibit 5?	5 Q	That was his position at the time of your
6 A		6	separation?
7 Q		7 A	Yes.
8	Facebook messages on February 15th on your	8 Q	And he used to be the commissioner of EMS,
9	behalf?	9	correct?
10 A		10 A	Correct.
11 Q		11 Q	And why is it that you believe that Ed Eckart
12 A	I'm not aware of any, yes.	12	may have been involved in your discharge?
13 Q	Do you believe that Donnie did anything else	13 A	Well, he was interviewed the day after the
14	with your phone?	14	post was made.
15 A	I don't know. I can't I don't have any	15 Q	Interviewed by whom?
16	evidence if he did.	16 A	Ed Gallek.
17 Q	Were any other text messages, Facebook	17 Q	Did he say anything?
18	messages, anything else sent on February 15th	18 À	He pretty much came on there and accused me of
19	that you did not send?	19	it before the hearing was held.
20 A		20 Q	Anything that you received that suggested that
21 Q		21	Ed made the decision to discharge you?
22	text messages sent that weren't from you?	22 A	No.
1 .		23 Q	Anybody say that it was Assistant Safety
23 A	can't remember what it was now. But I don't	24	Director Eckart's decision?
24			No.
25	recall specifically what it was.	25 A	NO.
	Dogg 110		Page 112
	Page 110		Page 112
1 Q		1 Q	Page 112 How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you
1 Q	-	1 Q 2	ū į
1	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged	1	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you
2	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you?	2 3 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration.
2 3 4 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes.	2 3 A 4 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for
2 3 4 A 5 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason?	2 3 A 4 Q 5	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No.	2 3 A 4 Q 5	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know.
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people.
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand.
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know.
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the posts once you saw them?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A 19 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved? Because it was a media story. I'm sure he was aware of it.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A 19 Q 20	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the posts once you saw them?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved? Because it was a media story. I'm sure he was aware of it.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the posts once you saw them? I erased them right away and then I posted a
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 A 21 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved? Because it was a media story. I'm sure he was aware of it. But no evidence to suggest that he was involved in the decision?	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the posts once you saw them? I erased them right away and then I posted a global apology. Status update apology.
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 A 21 Q 22 Q	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved? Because it was a media story. I'm sure he was aware of it. But no evidence to suggest that he was involved in the decision? I don't have any physical evidence, no.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A 22 23 Q	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the posts once you saw them? I erased them right away and then I posted a global apology. Status update apology. Why was it that you apologized?
2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q Q 19 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20	Do you believe that the Facebook posts on Exhibit 5 were the reason the City discharged you? Yes. Any other reason? No. Who do you think made the decision to discharge you? I don't know who did. Any idea? Any inkling whatsoever? Well, just three. Okay. Who are the three you think? Nicole Carlton, Ed Eckart or the Mayor. Any reason to believe or any evidence to suggest that the Mayor was involved in the decision to discharge you? Do I have any evidence? No. Why do you believe that the Mayor may have been involved? Because it was a media story. I'm sure he was aware of it. But no evidence to suggest that he was involved in the decision? I don't have any physical evidence, no.	2 3 A 4 Q 5 6 7 A 8 Q 9 10 A 11 12 13 Q 14 15 A 16 Q 17 18 A 19 Q 20 21 A 22 23 Q 24 A	How about Commissioner Carlton, why do you believe it was her decision to discharge you? Because she said it during the arbitration. Do you think it was an easy decision for Commissioner Carlton to make? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know. Do you have any idea who replaced you after your separation? Nobody directly replaced me. I think they hired — I heard they hired people or promoted a couple people. So after your separation someone else was promoted to captain of operations? That's what I understand. Your position remained there, it was just now somebody else was in it? Correct. As far as I know. So what exactly did you do in response to the posts once you saw them? I erased them right away and then I posted a global apology. Status update apology. Why was it that you apologized? Because I apologized if anybody thought it was

1 Q 2	Page 113			Page 115
-				
-	Did you apologize due to the inflammatory	1	Q	Do you remember who the councilman was?
1	nature of the posts?	1	À	Cintron.
зА	Yes.	3	Q	Can you spell that?
4 Q	How long did you think the posts were up for		A	C-i-n-t-r-o-n I believe.
5	total?	1	Q	And did you respond to the call?
6 A	I don't I'm not sure.	I	À	Yes.
7 Q	Less than probably at least less than 12	7	Q	Any other instance in which you testified in
8	hours if you went to bed at five?	8	_	court?
9 A	Definitely, yeah.	9	Α	Not that I can recall.
10 Q	Definitely less than 12. And did you contact	10	Q	Have you ever been convicted of any crimes?
11	Commissioner Carlton that day about the posts?	11	-	Traffic included?
12 A	Yes.	12	Q	Yes.
13 Q	And you contacted her the same day that you	13		Yes.
14	learned of the posts, correct?	14	Q	When was that? If we can, let's work
15 A	I believe so.	15	`	backward. When was the most recent?
16 Q	Did you ever file for bankruptcy before?	16	A	Oh, boy. 2002, maybe.
17	MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.	1	Q	Okay. What was that?
18 A	No.	18	_	A DUI.
19 Q	Other than your divorce have you ever been a		Q	And were you actually then convicted or did
20	party to another legal action? Not criminal,	20	•	you plead to a DUI?
21	civil.	21	Α	Yes.
22 A	Not that I'm aware.	l	Q	And the City was aware of that?
23 Q	Have you ever asserted any other claims	23		Yes.
24	against an employer?	1	Q	You kept your job?
25	MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.	25	_	No. Can I correct you?
	1.11.1 21 (11 (32 1 31 () 3) () () ()			2.50
	Page 114			Page 116
1 A	What do you mean by claims?	1	Q	Absolutely.
2 Q	Have you ever sued another employer?	1	À	It was 1997.
зÀ	No.	3	Q	Maybe '96?
4 Q	Not including the grievance related to your		À	Possible.
5	separation from the City did you ever file any	ı	Q	So that was shortly after you had been hired,
6	other grievance while you worked for the City?	6	`	right?
7 A	Yes, but I can't remember what for.	7	Α	Right.
8 Q	Do you have any idea how many you think you	8		So when you were hired where you hired I
9	filed?	9	•	have it at September 5, 1995; is that right?
10 A	Not many.	10	Α	Yes.
11 Q	Less than two, less than I mean less than	11		And what position were you hired into?
12	three?	12	-	Paramedic.
13 A	I can't remember because I was doing	13		EMT? Same thing or different?
14	grievances too as a union member. So as a	14	_	Different.
15	as an employee I don't believe I filed a	15		Different. Okay.
16	grievance, but if I did it was only one or	16	~	All right. Anything else that you can
17	two.	17		think of as to crimes that you may have been
18 Q	But you did obviously grieve your separation?	18		convicted for?
19 A	Yes. Yes.	19	Α	No.
20 Q	Have you ever testified in court before?	20		Did you receive any discipline from the City
-	Yes.	21	V	for that?
	When was that?	22	Δ	Yes.
	WILLIAM WAS LIAL!	l		
22 Q		22	$^{\circ}$	For the DIII I'm askino?
21 A 22 Q 23 A	It was in the '90s. Probably late '90s.	23		For the DUI I'm asking?
22 Q		23 24 25	Α	For the DUI I'm asking? Yes. Do you remember what that was?

Nicole	Carlton, et al.			December 12, 2018
	Page 121			Page 123
1	you had a smooth operation. It's the main	1 (o l	So I mean, in a nutshell EMS is responsible
2	point of the the dispatch center oversees	2	~	for caring for all individuals within the City
3	how the whole service is running.	3		regardless of race, how they were injured,
4 Q	So that's one. And then what is the other?	4		anything?
5 A	Field operations.		A	Absolutely, yes.
1	And what did that entail?	1	Q	As a captain were you responsible for
6 Q		1	Ų	enforcing the City's rules?
7 A	It entailed getting the staffing together for	7	A	Yes.
8	the field, allocating overtime, dealing with	1		Were you responsible for recommending
9	supply issues the units have, and then also	1	Q	· ·
10	going out and going on calls and monitoring	10	A	discipline?
11	field employees for compliance.	11 /		No.
12 Q	So you were responsible for potentially caring	12 (Ų	No. Were you responsible for reporting
13	for individuals that are injured as part of	13		misconduct?
14	crime?	14 /		Yes.
15 A	Yes.	15 (Ų	What would you have done if you saw the posts
16 Q	And you're aware that EMS responded to the	16		in Exhibit 5?
17	Tamir Rice shooting; is that correct?	17	_	MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.
18 A	Yes.	1	Q	And if they were made by a subordinate of
19 Q	And EMS was responsible for caring for Tamir?	19		yours, if they were on the page of a
20 A	I don't know what exactly happened on the	20		subordinate of yours, what would you have done
21	call, but I assume, yes. I don't know if he	21		in that instance?
22	called meaning I don't know if he was	22		MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.
23	pronounced or they transported him or not. I	23 /	A	A subordinate of mine?
24	don't remember.	24 (Q	Yes.
25 Q	He didn't actually pass away until the	25 A	A	Nothing.
	Page 122	-		Page 124
	•		_	•
1	following day or sometime after the shooting.	1 (-	Nothing. You would just have left them?
2	Do you recall that at all?	2 /		No. It happens all the time.
3 A	I don't remember.	3 (Q	Have you ever seen a post before where
4 Q	So assuming he was still alive at the time	4		somebody is disappointed that he didn't get a
5	they arrived on scene, EMS would have cared	5	_	chance to kill a child?
6	for Tamir?	1	A.	I haven't seen one, no.
7 A	I would imagine, yes. Hopefully.	7 (Q	So is it your contention then that it was
8 Q	And EMS transported Tamir?	8		improper for Captain Threat to report it?
9 A	I don't know. That's what I'm say, I don't	1	A.	I never said that.
10	know if they did or not.	10 (Q	Well, if you wouldn't have reported it if
11 Q	No reason to disagree with that or any reason	11		you saw it as captain, you wouldn't have
12	to dispute that EMS transported Tamir Rice?	12		reported these posts in Exhibit 5; is that was
13 A	If that's what you say I have to believe you.	13		your testimony is?
14	I don't have any evidence to the contrary.	. میدا	A	Yes.
1 -	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	14 /	_	
15 Q	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues	15 (So was it then improper for Captain Threat to
15 Q 16	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life?	1		
1 7	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues	15 (Q	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his
16	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life?	15 (16	Q A	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it?
16 17 A	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes.	15 (16 17 A	Q A	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his
16 17 A 18 Q	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes. Any idea whether or not any of your colleagues	15 (16 17 A 18 (Q A	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his Why wouldn't you have reported it?
16 17 A 18 Q 19	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes. Any idea whether or not any of your colleagues suffered trauma as a result of the Tamir Rice	15 (16 17 A 18 (19	Q A Q	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his Why wouldn't you have reported it? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. Asked and
16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 21 A	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes. Any idea whether or not any of your colleagues suffered trauma as a result of the Tamir Rice incident, including those that treated him?	15 (16 17 A 18 (19 20	Q A Q	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his Why wouldn't you have reported it? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. Asked and answered.
16 17 A 18 Q 19 20	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes. Any idea whether or not any of your colleagues suffered trauma as a result of the Tamir Rice incident, including those that treated him? I'm not aware. Is EMS also responsible for treating those	15 (16 17 18 (19 20 21 1	Q A Q A	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his Why wouldn't you have reported it? MR, LIVINGSTON: Objection. Asked and answered. Because nowhere does it say anything about EMS
16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 21 A 22 Q	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes. Any idea whether or not any of your colleagues suffered trauma as a result of the Tamir Rice incident, including those that treated him? I'm not aware.	15 (16 17 A 18 (19 20 21 A 22	Q A Q A	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his Why wouldn't you have reported it? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. Asked and answered. Because nowhere does it say anything about EMS on there.
16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 21 A 22 Q 23	Any reason to dispute that your EMS colleagues worked to save Tamir Rice's life? If they transported him they would have, yes. Any idea whether or not any of your colleagues suffered trauma as a result of the Tamir Rice incident, including those that treated him? I'm not aware. Is EMS also responsible for treating those that may be injured during times of civil	15 (16 17 A 18 (19 20 21 A 22 23 (Q A Q A	So was it then improper for Captain Threat to report it? No. That's his Why wouldn't you have reported it? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. Asked and answered. Because nowhere does it say anything about EMS on there. Just ignore it?

	Page 169	1	Page 171
	rage tos		rage III
1 Q	And then you would get off, and then would you	1	that. If you read it into the record so we
2	then go to sleep at that point?	2	have it. And that is a text from you to
3 A	Yes, most times.	3	Nicole, correct?
4 Q	And get up when?	4 A	You want me to read it?
5 A	It depends if I had to work or not.	5 Q	Yeah, just the first one.
6 Q	Do you know if you were scheduled to work on	6 A	"Before the word gets to you I have to tell
7	February 14th, the day Donnie came over? Did	7	you. A jerk of a friend grabbed my phone last
	you work that prior day?	В	night as I ran an errand and trying to be
8	•		funny made some awful Facebook posts. My
9 A	No, I believe I was on vacation.	9	friends called me today to let me know and I
10 Q	And then were you also on vacation that	10	
11	Monday, the 15th?	11	was horrified when I read them. These are not
12 A	I know I was on vacation the date of the	12	my beliefs and I certainly did not write them.
13	initial hearing with Votypka.	13	I posted an apology, but I feel the damage may
14 Q	Were you on vacation that whole week?	14	already have been done. Again, I just wanted
15 A	Part of it, yeah. I don't remember how many	15	you to know I did not post what was written."
16	days. It was a short it wasn't like a two	16	So the jerk of a friend, who are you
17	week vacation. It was short.	17	referring to there?
18 Q	So now on February 15th, the day you found out	18 A	Donnie.
19	about the text messages, you texted	19 Q	And what errand did you run?
20	Commissioner Carlton; is that right?	20 A	That's the laundry.
21 A	Yes, I did.	21 Q	That's when you were getting laundry?
22	(Defendants' Exhibit 22	22 A	Yeah, doing the laundry.
23	marked for identification.)	23 Q	So is that when he posted these, when you were
24 Q	Handing you what I've marked as Exhibit 22.	24	doing laundry?
25	When you get a chance, can you please identify	25 A	That's when I originally thought he did.
	,, non you got a chance, can you present taking,		in the state of th
1			
	Page 170		Page 172
1	_	1.0	
1 2 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir?	1 Q	And when did you and now you believe that
2 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and	2	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when?
2 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton.	2 3 A	And when did you and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had
2 A 3 4 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided?	2 3 A 4	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah.	2 3 A 4 5	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes.	2 3 A 4 5 6	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is	2 3 A 4 5 6 7	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page?	2 3 A 4 5 6 7	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete?	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right?	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know?	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time;	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 18 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time; do you remember? H what is this. It's three letters. I	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 18 Q 19 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them? Probably deleted them.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time; do you remember? H — what is this. It's three letters. I can't remember. It's H something something.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them? Probably deleted them. Do you recall when you deleted them? No.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 22	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time; do you remember? H — what is this. It's three letters. I can't remember. It's H something something. HTC. That's what it was.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A 22 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them? Probably deleted them. Do you recall when you deleted them? No. Before or after your separation?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 22 23 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time; do you remember? H — what is this. It's three letters. I can't remember. It's H something something. HTC. That's what it was. That was the phone you had?	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A 22 Q 23 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them? Probably deleted them. Do you recall when you deleted them? No. Before or after your separation? It would have been before.
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 22 23 Q 24 A	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time; do you remember? H — what is this. It's three letters. I can't remember. It's H something something. HTC. That's what it was. That was the phone you had? Yes, at the time.	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 20 Q 21 A 22 Q 23 A 24 Q	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them? Probably deleted them. Do you recall when you deleted them? No. Before or after your separation? It would have been before. Why did you delete them?
2 A 3 4 Q 5 A 6 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 17 A 18 Q 19 20 A 21 22 23 Q	what Exhibit 22 is for me, sir? It appears to be a partial post between me and Commissioner Carlton. These were text messages that you provided? Yes, some of them are cut off. Okay. Yeah. Yes. Okay. And then anything that is cut off, is the full text on the next page? That's what I was looking at. Okay. So they are complete? Okay. The best you recall; is that right? Yes. The time for the first text here, the time that you sent that, is that below the text or is the time above the text; if you know? I don't know. What kind of phone did you have at the time; do you remember? H — what is this. It's three letters. I can't remember. It's H something something. HTC. That's what it was. That was the phone you had?	2 3 A 4 5 6 7 8 9 Q 10 A 11 12 13 14 Q 15 A 16 Q 17 A 18 Q 19 A 20 Q 21 A 22 Q 23 A	And when did you — and now you believe that he posted them when? When I first read them I deleted them so I had no idea what time they were posted so I believe he did it when I was doing laundry. Then when I got copies of the actual posts, a hard copy, then I realized that they were done later in the day. Who did you get a hard copy of the posts from? I asked a couple people. I don't remember who said. I asked Wearstler and — I think Wearstler may have sent it to me. John Wearstler. How did he send those to you; do you recall? No, I don't. Do you still have those complete posts? No. What did you do with them? Probably deleted them. Do you recall when you deleted them? No. Before or after your separation? It would have been before.

141001	e Cariton, et al.			December 12, 2010
	Page 177			Page 179
1 Q	Do you recall beginning with after "Is your	1	Q	It says "My girls respect you," that your
2	friend able to send a letter; that would go a	2	•	girls respected Commissioner Carlton; is that
3	long way," do you recall the text message	3		accurate?
4	after that? So the text messages that you		Α	Yes, they went to the same school with her
5	provided, they end there.	5		daughter.
6 A	Yes.		Q	And did you respect Commissioner Carlton?
7 Q	And then Commissioner Carlton has a record of		À	Yes.
8	another text message from you where you say,	I	Q	Did you have a good relationship with
9	"I will take care of him in my own way. No,	9	`	Commissioner Carlton?
10	he will not do that under any circumstances.		Α	Yes.
11	Like I said, I'll deal with him." Do you	11		And was that true as of through your
12	recall texting Commissioner Carlton that?	12	`	separation, or as of your separation?
13 A	No, I don't recall but I don't deny it either.	13	Α	Before the separation.
14 Q	What about the next one, "He is afraid it will	14		Okay. So up until the point you were
15	end up on the news and he will be labeled as a	15	`	separated you had what you would classify as a
16	racist. Although the post was not criminal in	16		good relationship with Commissioner Carlton?
17	any way, it was very insensitive and I do not	17	A	Yes.
18	want anyone attempting to kill him over this."	18		Do you have any reason to believe that
19	Do you recall sending that text message to	19	•	Commissioner Carlton hated you for any reason?
20	Commissioner Carlton?	20	A	No.
21 A	No, I don't. I don't deny it either.	21		Any reason to believe that Commissioner
22 Q	Same thing with the next text message. At	22		Carlton would act maliciously towards you?
23	some point you texted Commissioner Carlton	23	Α	I don't have any evidence of that.
24	what the post was; did you not?	24		Any reason to think that Commissioner Carlton
25 A	Yes.	25	`	acted with ill will toward you?
	·			•
	Page 178			Page 180
1 Q	And you did that that day?	1	Α	I believe it was an overreaction is what I
2 A	I believe so, yes.	2		believe.
3 Q	And that post is or at least that text	3	Q	But not necessarily out of ill will toward you
4	appears to be the substance of the post?	4	•	as a person?
5 A	I don't remember if she asked for it or if I	5	A	I don't think it was a personal attack.
6	just sent it to her.	6	Q	And then Thursday, March 17, that was I
7 Q	Okay. But you recall texting her?	7	•	believe the day after you received notice of
8 A	I believe I did, yes.	8		your separation. Thursday, March 17, 2016.
9 Q	How about "That was the post I feel so	9		Do you recall sending that text message to
10	bad right now;" do you recall texting her	10		Commissioner Carlton?
11	that?	11	Α	Yes, I do.
12 A	No, but I may have.		Q	Flipping back to the first page, the second
13 Q	Don't deny sending her that text?	13	₹.	text from the bottom, it says "He's afraid it
14 A	Right, I'm not denying it.	14		will end up on the news and he will be labled
15 Q	And then the next one, "Do you now understand	15		as a racist." Labeled spelled a little wrong
16	why I am so upset?"; do you recall texting her	16		but I'm assuming that's what was meant. He,
17	that?	17		is that referring to Donnie?
18 A	I kind of remember that, yes.	18	Α	It appears so, yes.
19 Q	And then on March 19th presumably 2016 did you	19		And did Donnie express this to you at any
20	text Commissioner Carlton about a story that	20	•	point in time?
21	aired on Channel 19 about her? Take your	21	Α	I don't recall it but if I wrote it he must
22	time. It's the second to last text.	22		have.
			^	
1		23	U	When we talked earlier you didn't testify that
23 A	Yes, I believe I texted her that, yes.	23 24	Q	When we talked earlier you didn't testify that he had said anything along these lines; do you
23 A 24 Q			Ų	he had said anything along these lines; do you recall that?
23 A	Yes, I believe I texted her that, yes. Is that how you felt at the time?	24	Ų	he had said anything along these lines; do you

	e Cariton, et al.		December 12, 2016
	Page 193		Page 195
1	way to your employment or your separating from	1	regulations it was referring to. In that case
2	the City?	2	it would be progressive discipline and stuff
3 A	That she's been charged with a crime?	3	like that.
4 Q	Yes, that's what the question is.	4 Q	Anything other than progressive discipline
5 A	I have no idea.	5	that you know of?
6 Q	Are you aware of whether or not Ms. Carlton	6 A	No, I don't know.
7	has been convicted of any crime related to	7 Q	What about in 53, Subparagraph A, it talks
8	your employment or separation?	B	about, "The policies operate as an
9 A	Not that I'm aware of.	9	unconstitutional prior restraint on the
10 Q	Are you aware of anyone at the City of	10	dissemination of constitutionally protected
11	Cleveland that's been convicted of a crime	11	expression." What policies are you referring
12	related to your separation?	12	to there?
13 A	Not that I'm aware of.	13 A	I didn't write this.
14 Q	Are you aware of anyone at the City of	14 Q	So do you know what policies are being
15	Cleveland that's been convicted of a crime	15	referenced there?
16	related in any way to your employment with the	16 A	No.
17	City?	17 Q	Do you know what policies or do you have an
18 A	Not that I'm aware of.	18	understanding of what policies that you're
19 Q	Do you have any reason to believe that	19	alleging are unconstitutional?
20	Commissioner Carlton's discharge or that your	20	MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. Asked and
21	discharge was a crime?	21	answered.
22 A	Yes, I do believe it was.	22 A	I would I mean, I can speculate.
23 Q	What crime do you believe was violated?	23	MR. LIVINGSTON: You don't have to
24 A	Violation of my civil rights.	24	speculate.
25 Q	It's a criminal violation you're suggesting?	25 A	No, I don't.
<	To a diministration of the budgetime.		.10, 1 0011
	~ -		
	Page 194		Page 196
1 A	Page 194 I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil.	1 Q	Page 196 So as you sit here today it's unclear to you
1 A 2 Q	_	1 Q 2	·
1	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil.	_	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you
2 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime?	2	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st
2 Q 3	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge	2 3	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct?
2 Q 3 4	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime?	2 3 4 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes.
2 Q 3 4 5	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection.	2 3 4 A 5 Q	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts?	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct?	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6?	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations;	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that?	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there?	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 6 A 17 Q 18 19 20	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. He didn't draft the complaint.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to Defendant Carlton" And it goes on to say
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. He didn't draft the complaint. You can answer.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to Defendant Carlton" And it goes on to say training as to constitutionally protected
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 A	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. He didn't draft the complaint. You can answer. I'm not sure what I meant.	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to Defendant Carlton" And it goes on to say training as to constitutionally protected speech. Do you see that?
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 A 23 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. He didn't draft the complaint. You can answer. I'm not sure what I meant. Okay. So you don't know offhand what rules	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 23 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to Defendant Carlton" And it goes on to say training as to constitutionally protected speech. Do you see that? Yes.
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 A 23 Q 24	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. He didn't draft the complaint. You can answer. I'm not sure what I meant. Okay. So you don't know offhand what rules and regulations you claim are violated?	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 23 A 24 Q	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to Defendant Carlton" And it goes on to say training as to constitutionally protected speech. Do you see that? Yes. What other supervisory employees are you
2 Q 3 4 5 6 A 7 Q 8 9 A 10 Q 11 A 12 Q 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 A 23 Q	I'm not sure if it's criminal or civil. Do you have any reason to believe that Commissioner Carlton thought your discharge was a crime? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. I don't know what she was thinking. You can't speak to Commissioner Carlton's thoughts? Yes. Or what she may have believed, correct? Right. I don't want to do that. Go to Page 9. See where it says Count 6? Yes. Paragraph 53 refers to rules and regulations; do you see that? Yes. What rules and regulations are you referring to there? MR. LIVINGSTON: Objection. He's not a lawyer. He didn't draft the complaint. You can answer. I'm not sure what I meant. Okay. So you don't know offhand what rules	2 3 4 A 5 Q 6 A 7 Q 8 9 10 A 11 Q 12 13 A 14 Q 15 16 A 17 Q 18 19 20 21 22 23 A	So as you sit here today it's unclear to you what policies you're alleging violate the 1st and 14th Amendment, correct? Yes. Do you want to go to work for the City again? Yes. Do you have any other claims that you're alleging against the City other than those that are outlined in Exhibit 26? Everything is in here. So any claim that you may have is in Exhibit 26, your complaint? Yes. Real quick, as to Count 5, it's going to be on Page 8. You see Paragraph 50 there? Yes. It alleges that, "The City has failed to train or inadequately trains its supervisory employees, including but not limited to Defendant Carlton" And it goes on to say training as to constitutionally protected speech. Do you see that? Yes.

1 State of Ohio, SS: CERTIFICATE County of Cuyahoga, 2 3 I, Karen A. Toth, Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, duly commissioned and qualified, do 4 5 hereby certify that the within named witness, Jamie Marquardt, was by me first duly sworn to 6 7 testify the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth in the cause aforesaid; that the testimony 8 9 then given by him was by me reduced to 10 stenotypy/computer in the presence of said witness, afterward transcribed, and that the foregoing is a 11 12 true and correct transcript of the testimony so 13 given by him as aforesaid. I do further certify that this deposition was 14 taken at the time and place in the foregoing caption 15 16 specified and was completed without adjournment 17 I do further certify that I am not a relative, 18 counsel, or attorney of either party, or otherwise 19 interested in the event of this action. 20 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my 21 hand and affixed my seal of office at Clevelatta!!" 22 Ohio on this 27th day of December, 2018.§ 23 Toth, Notary Public in 24 Karen A. and for the State of Ohio. 25 My Commission expires May 6, 2023.